

A systematic review of randomized controlled trials assessing phytochemicals and natural ingredients for skin and hair care

Samar Thiab¹, Nizar M. Mhaidat², May Abu Taha¹, Sarah Thiab³, Somaya Koraysh³, Reem Abutayeh¹, Iman Basheti¹

Table 1: Summary of randomized controlled trials (RCTs) conducted between 1997 and 2020 of plants, herbs, or isolated compounds used for skin care.

| Skin care (n = 53) | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------------------------|---------|--|--|-------------------|---|--|----------|-------------------------------|-----------|---|
| Author, year | Country | Population (n) | Intervention (dose/method of application) | Comparison(s) | Outcome(s), p value | Method of testing | Duration | Scientific name of plant used | Part used | Dosage form |
| Skin protection | | | | | | | | | | |
| Gonzalez S et al., 1997 | Spain | 18–46-year-old males and females untreated or treated with oral psoralens (21) | Topical or oral <i>Polypodium leucotomos</i> (oral dose = 1080 mg) | Untreated control | 1. Immediate pigment darkening (IPD): UV dose significantly increased (p<0.01) 2. Minimal erythema dose (MED): UV dose significantly increased (p<0.01) 3. Minimal melanogenic dose (MMD): no significant difference 4. Minimal phototoxic dose (MPD): UV dose significantly increased (p<0.01) 5. Langerhans cells examination: partial prevention of acute phototoxicity compared with untreated skin | 1. Immediate pigment darkening (IPD) 2. Minimal erythema dose (MED) 3. Minimal melanogenic dose (MMD) 4. Minimal phototoxic dose (MPD) 5. Langerhans cells examination of psoralen-sensitized volunteers | 3 days | <i>Polypodium leucotomos</i> | - | Capsules containing 120 mg <i>Polypodium leucotomos</i> or lotion containing 10, 25, and 50% <i>Polypodium leucotomos</i> extract (v/v) |
| Camouse M et al., 2008 | USA | 19–58-year-old males and females (90) | Topical green tea or topical white tea applied min | Placebo | Contact hypersensitivity (CHS): no significant effect (p>0.05) | Contact hypersensitivity (CHS) evaluated by the total millimetre increase in | 2 days | <i>Camellia sinensis</i> | - | - |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|-----------------------|----------|--|--|---------|--|--|----------|------------------------------|------|----------|
| | | | prior to solar-simulated ultraviolet radiation (ssUVR) irradiation, as well as immediately after it | | | skin fold thickness (SFT) | | | | |
| Rival D et al., 2009 | France | Group A: 40–50-year-old females (20) Group B: 50–60-year-old females (40) | Group A: topical product containing 3% <i>Hibiscus abelmoschus</i> Group B: topical product containing 3% <i>Hibiscus abelmoschus</i> and topical product containing 3% vitamin C | Placebo | 1. Skin elasticity: improved for both groups and both products 2. Skin firmness, texture, and density: improved for both groups and both products Fringe projection: significantly reduced compared to the placebo in group B for both products (p<0.05) | 1. Skin elasticity measured on the cheek using a ballistometer 2. A visual and tactile evaluation of skin firmness, texture, and density performed by an expert clinician 3. Depth of the main wrinkle analyzed by fringe projection | 6 weeks | <i>Hibiscus abelmoschus</i> | Seed | - |
| Bazin R et al., 2010 | Germany | 45–65-year-old Caucasian females (24) | Emulsion containing soy and jasmine applied twice daily | Placebo | Global signals detected in the dermis significantly higher (p<0.05) | Multilayers acquisitions using a multiphoton tomograph with subcellular resolution | 12 weeks | - | - | Emulsion |
| Akhtar N et al., 2011 | Pakistan | 24–35-year-old healthy males and females (21) | W/O emulsions containing 3% | Placebo | Hydration and firmness of skin were significantly improved (p<0.05) | Mechanical parameters of the skin using noninvasive suction skin elasticity meter | 8 weeks | <i>Calendula officinalis</i> | - | Cream |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|------------------------|--------|---|---|-------------------|---|--|--|--|---|-------|
| | | | <i>Calendula officinalis</i> | | | Cutometer 580 MPA | | | | |
| Wineman E et al., 2012 | Israel | Antiwrinkles effect: ≥ 45 -year-old females (20) Skin hydration: 19–60-year-old females (10) | A cream containing complex of Dead Sea water and three Himalayan (Tibetan goji berries, moss lichen, and Himalayan raspberry) extracts applied once daily | Untreated control | Antiwrinkles effect: wrinkles depth significantly reduced ($p < 0.05$) Skin hydration: significantly increased ($p < 0.05$) | Antiwrinkles effect: the depth of one single wrinkle in the eye examined before and after application by PRIMOS optical 3D measuring device Skin hydration: electrical capacitance measured using capacitance meter (Corneometer CM 825) | Antiwrinkles effect: 4 weeks Skin hydration: 12 hours | - | Tibetan goji: berries Himalayan raspberry: root | Cream |
| Danby SG et al., 2013 | UK | Cohort 1: males and females with an average age of 46 ± 5.7 years with previous atopic dermatitis (AD), no symptoms for 6 months (7) Cohort 2: males and females with an average age of 46 ± 5.7 years with/without previous AD, no symptoms for 6 | Cohort 1: Six drops of olive oil applied to the forearm twice daily Cohort 2: six drops of olive oil or sunflower oil applied to the forearm twice daily | Untreated control | Cohort 1: 1. Transepidermal water loss (TEWL): significantly increased with tape stripping ($p < 0.001$) 2. Cohesiveness of stratum corneum (SC): significantly decreased in volunteers with a history of AD ($p < 0.05$) 3. SC hydration: no significant effect ($p > 0.05$) 4. Erythema: higher Cohort 2: 1. TEWL: no significant effect 2. Cohesiveness of SC: no significant effect ($p > 0.05$) 3. SC hydration: significantly | 1. Skin-surface pH measured using pH meter (PH905) 2. Stratum corneum (SC) hydration measured using Corneometer (CM825) 3. Erythema measured using Mexameter (MX 18) 4. Transepidermal water loss (TEWL) measured using an AquaFlux AF200 5. Protein removed using tape stripping performed in conjunction with TEWL, then the | Cohort 1: 5 weeks Cohort 2: 4 weeks | <i>Olea europaea</i> <i>Helianthus annuus</i> | <i>Olea europaea</i> : fruit <i>Helianthus annuus</i> : seed | Oil |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------------------------|-------------|--|---|--|--|--|----------|--|---|--------|
| | | months (12) | | | higher (p<0.05) 4. Erythema: no significant effect (p>0.05) | amount of protein that each disc immediately determined using infrared densitometry | | | | |
| Ilnytska O et al., 2016 | USA | 18–65-year-old healthy females with bilateral moderate to severe dry skin on their lower legs (50) | Colloidal lotion containing oatmeal extract applied twice daily | Untreated control | 1. Dry skin: significantly improved (p<0.05) 2. Skin barrier integrity and hydration: significantly improved (p<0.05) | 1. Dry skin: visual evaluation and using Dermalab 2. Skin barrier integrity and hydration assessed by transepidermal water loss (TEWL) measurements and using Skicon 200 EX | 5 weeks | <i>Avena sativa</i> | - | Lotion |
| Ray S et al., 2016 | UK | 40–68-year-old males (32) | Low-concentration or high concentration blackcurrant juice drink | Placebo | No significant difference (p>0.05) | 1. Phototesting using a calibrated irradiation monochromator 2. Minimal erythema dose (MED) | 6 weeks | - | - | Juice |
| Lee KE et al., 2016 | South Korea | Females with an average age of 47.7 ± 4.8 years (20) | 0.5% phenolic veratric acid cream | Placebo | 1. Visual evaluation: showed improvement 2. Photometric evaluation: significantly improved (p<0.01) 3. Self-assessment: positive feedback | 1. Visual evaluation 2. Photometric evaluation using Skin-Visiometer SV 600 3. Self-assessment | 12-weeks | - | - | Cream |
| Wang Y et al., 2017 | France | Females with an average age of 37.1 ± 10.6 years with dry and sensitive skin (20) | A cream containing Yunnan <i>Portulaca oleracea</i> extract, <i>Prinsepia utilis</i> oil, | A control cream containing <i>Carthamus tinctorius</i> extract and oil | 1. Visual evaluation: a significant improvement 2. Self-assessment questionnaire: test cream was significantly favoured (p<0.05) of dryness, erythema, and roughness was observed | 1. Visual evaluation including dryness, roughness, desquamation, and erythema 2. Self-assessment questionnaire 3. Transepidermal | 4 weeks | <i>Portulaca oleracea</i> <i>Prinsepia utilis</i> | - | Cream |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------------------|--------|---------------------------------------|---|---------|--|---|---------|--------------------------|----------------|-----------------------------|
| | | | beta-glucan, and sodium hyaluronate extracted from mushroom applied to 1 side of the face twice daily | | compared to baseline (p<0.05). For skin desquamation, no significant difference was observed 3. Hydration index: significantly increased (p<0.05) 4. Skin texture parameter: roughness significantly declined, and smoothness significantly increased (p<0.05) 5. Skin barrier function (TEWL), sebum recovery (lipid index), wettability, color, and stinging test: no significant effect (p>0.05) | water loss assessment using Vapometer 4. Skin hydration assessment using Corneometer CM825 5. Lipid index assessment using Sebumeter SM 815 6. Skin texture assessment using Visioscan VC98 7. Skin-surface wettability 8. Skin color using Minolta 400 Chroma Meter 9. Skin sensitivity using a stinging test with 10% lactic acid | | | | |
| Egoumenides L et al., 2018 | France | 19–50-year-old healthy Caucasian (93) | 1. A melon concentrate capsule containing 20 mg superoxide dismutase 2. Cream containing 12 U superoxide dismutase per cm ² of skin | Placebo | Minimal Erythema Dose (MED): significantly higher for both cream and capsule (p<0.05) | Minimal Erythema Dose (MED) using ORIEL solar simulator as a source of radiations | 4 weeks | <i>Cucumis melo</i> L. | Skin and seeds | 1. Hard capsule 2. Cream |
| Antiaging | | | | | | | | | | |
| Martelli L et al., 2000 | Italy | 20–25-year-old healthy female (20) | A cream containing boswellic | Placebo | 1. Skin hydration: no significant difference 2. Biomechanical properties: | 1. Skin Hydration measured by electrical capacitance by | 4 weeks | <i>Centella asiatica</i> | | Cream |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------------|--------|-------------------------------------|--|---------|--|--|----------|--------------------------------|--------|-------|
| | | | acids, silybin, and <i>Centella asiatica</i> extracts | | significantly increased (p<0.02) No adverse effects were reported | Coneometer 2. Biomechanical properties (extensibility and firmness) of the skin measured using suction device (Dermaflex) | | | | |
| Bauza E et al., 2002 | France | 46–58-year-old females (10) | Cream with 5% date palm kernel extract on the eye area twice daily | Placebo | 1. Skin microrelief evaluation: total surface of wrinkles was significantly reduced (p<0.05) 2. Clinical evaluation: 60% of participants showed improvement 3. Questionnaire: 50% of participants reported improvement | 1. Skin microrelief evaluation: silicon replica analysis using a software 2. Clinical evaluation under a magnifying glass 3. Questionnaire | 5 weeks | - | Kernel | Cream |
| Kim YH et al., 2008 | Korea | 35–53-year-old healthy females (20) | 0.03% ziyuglycoside I cream | Placebo | 1. Visual evaluation: intervention showed a nonsignificant difference between 4-8 weeks, significant results were observed after 12 weeks of treatment (p<0.05) 2. Photometric evaluation: mean depth of roughness showed a significant difference in 12 weeks (p<0.05) | 1. Visual evaluation using photodamage score 2. Photometric evaluation using Skin-Visiometer SV 600 | 12-weeks | <i>Sanguisorba officinalis</i> | Root | Cream |
| Kim YH et al., 2010 | Spain | 34-49-year-old healthy females (25) | 0.2% <i>P. strobilacea</i> extract | Placebo | 1. Visual evaluation: intervention showed a nonsignificant difference between 4-8 weeks, significant results were observed after 12 weeks of treatment (p<0.05) | 1. Visual evaluation 2. Photometric evaluation 3. Image analysis using Skin-Visiometer SV 600 | 12-weeks | <i>Platycarya strobilacea</i> | Fruit | Cream |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------------------------|----------|---|---|---------|--|---|----------|---|---|-------|
| | | | | | 2. Photometric evaluation: average difference in roughness showed a significant difference in 12 weeks (p<0.05) | | | | | |
| Kanlayavattanakul M et al., 2016 | Thailand | 25–50-year-old healthy males and females (24) | Cream containing 0.1 or 0.2% rice panicle extract applied twice daily | Placebo | Skin hydration: significantly improved (p<0.05) Skin lightening: significantly improved (p<0.001) Skin firming: significantly increased (p<0.05) Skin wrinkle: significantly reduced (p<0.05) | Clinical evaluation using Corneometer® CM 825, Cutometer® MPA 580, Mexameter® MX 18 and Visioscan® VC 98 | 12 weeks | <i>Oryza sativa cv. indica</i> | Rice panicle | Cream |
| Yoshida H et al., 2018 | Japan | 34–56-year-old healthy females (21) | A gel containing 20 mg/mL of <i>G. thunbergii</i> extract | Placebo | Skin wrinkle scores: significantly reduced (p<0.05) Skin hydration: significantly improved (p<0.05) No side effects reported | 1. The antiwrinkle efficacy evaluated by visual scoring by a dermatologist, 3D skin replica images obtained from the eye corner using Silflo® and the 3D image analyzer PRIMOS system. 2. Skin elasticity measured using the Cutometer DUAL MPA580 w | 8 weeks | <i>Geranium thunbergii</i> | Leaves | Gel |
| Roh S. et al., 2018 | Korea | 40–50-year-old healthy females (46) | SHYBE extract included: 0.0385% liquorice extract, 0.0765% <i>Angelica gigas</i> extract, | Placebo | 1. Skin hydration: significantly increased at week 4 (p<0.05) 2. Skin elasticity: significantly increased at week 4 (p<0.05) 3. Dermal thickness and density: significantly increased at week 4 (p<0.05) 4. Self-assessment: no | 1. Skin hydration evaluation using Corneometer® CM 825 2. Skin elasticity evaluated using Cutometer® MPA580 3. Dermal thickness and density evaluation | 8 weeks | Licorice: <i>Glycyrrhiza glabra</i> , <i>Angelica gigas</i> , Peach: <i>Prunus persica</i> , <i>Ophiopogon</i> | <i>Glycyrrhiza glabra</i> : root, <i>Angelica gigas</i> : root, <i>Prunus persica</i> : | Cream |

| | | | | | | |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| | | 0.0765% peach extract, 0.0765% <i>Ophiopogon japonicus</i> extract, 0.0765% <i>Paeonia suffruticosa</i> extract, 0.0765% <i>Atractylodes japonica</i> extract, 0.1290% <i>Poria cocos</i> , 0.1290% <i>Rehmannia chinensis</i> extract, 0.0385% <i>Cimicifuga simplex</i> extract, 0.0765% <i>Asparagus cochinchinensis</i> extract (0.0765%), 0.0385% safflower extract, 0.0385% <i>Scutellaria baicalensis</i> extract (0.0385%), | significant differences 5. Safety assessment: No adverse events were reported | Dermascan® C 4. Self-assessment using a questionnaire 5. Safety assessment by a dermatology specialist | <i>on japonicus</i> , <i>Paeonia suffruticosa</i> , <i>Atractylodes japonica</i> , <i>Poria cocos</i> , <i>Rehmannia chinensis</i> , <i>Cimicifuga simplex</i> , <i>Asparagus cochinchinensis</i> , <i>Scutellaria baicalensis</i> , <i>Astragalus membranaceus</i> , Safflower: <i>Carthamus tinctorius</i> | kernel, <i>Ophiopogon japonicus</i> : root, <i>Paeonia suffruticosa</i> : root, <i>Atractylodes japonica</i> : rhizome, <i>Poria cocos</i> : sclerotium, <i>Rehmannia chinensis</i> : root, <i>Cimicifuga simplex</i> : root, <i>Asparagus cochinchinensis</i> : root, <i>Carthamus tinctorius</i> : flower, <i>Scutellar</i> |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------------------|-----|--|--|-------------------|---|---|--|---|---|-------|
| | | | and 0.1290% <i>Astragalus membranaceus</i> extract | | | | | | <i>ia baicalensis</i> : root, and <i>Astragalus membranaceus</i> root | |
| Goldberg DJ et al., 2019 | USA | <p>Efficacy and tolerability study: 40–65-year-old healthy females (39)</p> <p>Hydration study and transepidermal water loss study: 18–65-year-old males and females (24)</p> <p>Test in oily skin: 30–65-year-old healthy females (31)</p> <p>Noncomedogenic study: 18–55-year-old females with combination or oily</p> | Night facial serum (NFS) containing melatonin, bakuchiol, and ascorbyl tetraisopalmitate applied daily | Untreated control | <p>Efficacy and tolerability study:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Wrinkle roughness: significantly decreases (p<0.05) 2. Skin firmness: skin deformation volume and depth decreased significantly (p<0.05) 3. Pigmentation: Significant decrease in pigmentation in comparison with baseline (p<0.05) <p>Hydration study and transepidermal water loss study:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Hydration kinetics: significantly improved (p<0.05) 2. Transepidermal water loss (TEWL): significantly improved until after 6 hours of application only (p<0.01) <p>Test in oily skin</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Sebum secretion: | <p>Efficacy and tolerability study:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Wrinkles assessment using Dermatop 2. Firmness assessment using Dynaskin 3. Pigmentation assessment using A CM-700d Spectrocolorimeter 4. Subject questionnaire <p>Hydration study and transepidermal water loss study:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Hydration kinetics using a Corneometer CM825 probe connected to a Cutometer dual MPA 580 2. Transepidermal water loss (TEWL) using a Tewameter® | <p>Efficacy and tolerability study: 13 weeks</p> <p>Hydration study and transepidermal water loss study: 12 hours</p> <p>Test in oily skin: 28 days</p> <p>Noncomedogenesis study: 28 days</p> | <i>Psoralea corylifolia</i> to obtain bakuchiol | Seeds | Serum |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|---------------------|-------|---|--|---------|---|--|---------|------------------------------------|-------|---|
| | | facial skin with comeDones (33) | | | significantly decreased ($p < 0.01$) Noncomedogenesis study: 1. 85% of subjects had fewer comeDones after 28 days of treatment | TM 300 Test in oily skin: 1. Forehead sebaceous secretion measured using the Sebumeter SM 815 2. Subject questionnaire Noncomedogenesis study: 1. Clinical examination 2. Self-assessment | | | | |
| Zeng X et al., 2019 | China | 35–60-year-old females with bilateral visible static crow's feet (20) | Formulation containing 2% <i>Zanthoxylum bungeanum</i> maxim extract | Placebo | 1. Skin roughness: no significant difference ($p > 0.05$) 2. Skin hydration: no significant difference ($p > 0.05$) 3. Skin elasticity: no significant difference ($p > 0.05$) 4. Subjective assessments: IGA score significantly decreased 5. Participants' self-assessment: 90% reported some improvement | 1. Objective assessments of pictures taken using VISIA®. Crow's feet were measured by Primospico, a three-dimensional system for measuring skin roughness quantitatively 2. Skin hydration measured using Corneometer® CM825 3. Skin elasticity measured using Cutometer® MPA580 4. Subjective assessments: Investigator's global assessment (IGA) of the severity of the | 4 weeks | <i>Zanthoxylum bungeanum</i> maxim | Fruit | - |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|-------|--|--|--------------------------|---|---|----------|--|---|-------|
| | | | | | | crow's feet recorded using a scale from 0 to 6 5. Participants' self-assessment of efficacy graded as worse, no improvement, some improvement, moderate improvement, and excellent improvement | | | | |
| Im AR et al., 2020 | Korea | 40–59-year old Soyang- (SY-) type females (21) | Cream including 0.3 % <i>C. teeta</i> and <i>T. rosthornii</i> extract applied to the area around the eyes twice daily | Placebo | 1. Visual assessment of skin wrinkles: skin damage was significantly restored ($p < 0.05$) 2. Evaluation of skin wrinkle parameters using replica images: significantly decreased ($p < 0.05$) 3. Questionnaire evaluation by participants: no significant difference ($p > 0.05$) 4. Skin safety evaluation: no adverse dermatological events were observed | 1. Visual assessment of skin wrinkles under specific lighting conditions 2. Evaluation of skin wrinkle parameters using replica images analyzed using Visioline VL650 3. Questionnaire evaluation by participants 4. Skin safety evaluation performed by assessing skin irritation through an interview and by medical examination | 12 weeks | <i>Coptis teeta</i> <i>Trichosanthes rosthornii</i> | <i>Coptis teeta</i> : rhizome <i>Trichosanthes rosthornii</i> : seed | Cream |
| Melasma/hyperpigmentation treatment and skin whitening | | | | | | | | | | |
| Altaei T et al., 2012 | Iraq | 28–55-year-old males and females with melasma (96) | A cream containing 0.1% or 0.2% silymarin applied twice | No treatment and Placebo | 1. Skin pigment evaluation (MASI): significantly improved ($p < 0.05$) 2. Physician global assessment (PGA): | 1. Skin pigment evaluation by melasma area and severity index (MASI) 2. Physician global | 4 weeks | <i>Silybum marianum</i> | - | Cream |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------------------------|-------------|--|---|-----------------------------------|---|---|----------|-------------------------------|--------|----------------------------|
| | | | daily | | significantly improved (p<0.05) 3. Assessment of overall treatment: significantly satisfied (p<0.05) | assessment (PGA) 3. Assessment of overall treatment using a scale from 0 to 10 | | | | |
| Shin DH et al., 2013 | Korea | 21–53-year-old participants (25) | Lotion with 0.05% <i>S. flavescens</i> extract applied twice daily | Placebo | Significantly whitening by device and visual assessment (p<0.05) | 1. Visual assessment by dermatologists 2. Whitening effects measured using a chromameter CR-400 | 8 weeks | <i>Sophora flavescens</i> | root | Lotion |
| White GM et al., 2013 | USA | Hispanic females with moderate-to-severe facial melasma (40) | Oral <i>Polypodium leucotomos</i> extract three times daily | Placebo | 1. Melasma Area Severity Index (MASI): No significant difference (p= 0.14) 2. Assessment of melasma-related quality of life (MelasQOL): No significant difference (p = 0.62) | 1. Melasma Area Severity Index (MASI) 2. Assessment of melasma-related quality of life (MelasQOL) | 12 weeks | <i>Polypodium leucotomos</i> | - | - |
| Mendoza CG et al., 2014 | Philippines | 18–60-year-old males and females with epidermal and mixed melasma (45) | 3% <i>Rumex occidentalis</i> cream applied twice daily | 4% hydroquinone cream and placebo | 1. Melasma Area Severity Index (MASI): significantly improved compared with baseline (p<0.05) 2. Skin pigmentation and Mexameter MX18 readings: significantly improved compared with baseline (p<0.05) | 1. Melasma Area Severity Index (MASI) 2. Skin pigmentation: using Mexameter MX18 | 8 weeks | <i>Rumex occidentalis</i> | - | Cream |
| Morag M et al., 2015 | Poland | 26–55-year-old females with melasma and lentigo solaris (102) | A cream with the aqueous extract from leaf of five-leaf serratula containing 2.51% of arbutin applied twice | Placebo | Average level of melanin: significantly improved for patients with melasma (p<0.05) | 1. Skin discoloration and measuring the average level of melanin: video dermatoscope DermoGenius (LINOS) and a probe Mexameter MX18 2. Dermatoscopic | 8 weeks | <i>Serratula quinquefolia</i> | Leaves | Cream with aqueous extract |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------------------------|-------|--|--|---------------------------|--|--|----------|---|-------|----------|
| | | | daily | | | examination: probe Mexameter MX18 | | | | |
| Lee HK et al., 2018 | Korea | 20–30-year-old females (40) | A cream with 2% (wt %) <i>Poria cocos</i> Wolf extracts applied once daily in the morning | Placebo | Skin brightness increased significantly (p<0.05) | Visual evaluation 2. Skin tone improvement measured using a Spectrophotometer CR 2600D | 4 weeks | <i>Poria cocos</i> Wolf | - | Cream |
| Zhang MS et al., 2019 | China | 25–50-year-old males and females with melasma (90) | A cream containing herbal mixture (<i>China camellia</i> (1%), Sanchi (0.5%), <i>Prinsepia utilis</i> oil (0.5%), and <i>Portulaca oleracea</i> (1%)) | Arbutin cream and placebo | 1. Melasma area and severity index (MASI) score: significantly improved after 12 weeks (p<0.05) 2. Melanin index (MI): significantly decreased after 12 weeks (p<0.05) 3. Erythema index (EI): significantly decreased after 12 weeks (p<0.05) 4. The density of inflammatory cells: significantly decreased after 12 weeks (p <0.05) 5. The subjective satisfaction scores: “very satisfied” increased from 13.3% at week 4 to 33.3% at week 12 | 1. Melasma area and severity index (MASI) score, melanin index (MI), erythema index (EI), using Mexameter and photographed using VISIA 2. Assessment of density of inflammatory cells using a reflectance confocal microscopy 3. The subjective satisfaction scores: The volunteers evaluated their satisfaction with the following criteria: 0 = not satisfied, 1 = partially satisfied, 2 = satisfied, or 3 = very satisfied | 12 weeks | <i>China camellia</i> , <i>Sanchi</i> , <i>Prinsepia utilis</i> , and <i>Portulaca oleracea</i> | - | Cream |
| Tsuchiya T et al., 2020 | Japan | 30–59-years-old females (100) | 200 ml beverage containing 200 mg of | Placebo | 1. Sunspot scores: significantly reduced (p<0.05) 2. Melanin index value: significantly reduced (p<0.05) | 1. Sunspot score diagnosed by a dermatologist 2. Melanin index value | 12 weeks | <i>Vitis vinifera</i> | Fruit | Beverage |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------------------------|--------|---|--|---------|---|---|----------|---------------------------|-------|-----------------------------------|
| | | | red wine oligomeric procyanidins once daily | | 3. Water content of the stratum corneum: significantly increased ($p < 0.05$) 4. Skin viscoelasticity: no significant difference ($p > 0.05$) 5. Wrinkle depth, and visual analog scale (VAS) questionnaire: no significant difference ($p > 0.05$) | in sunspots, and skin color using a CIE 1976 lightness 3. Water content of the stratum corneum 4. Skin viscoelasticity 5. Wrinkle depth, and visual analog scale (VAS) questionnaire | | | | |
| Bagatin JT et al., 2020 | Brazil | 32–49-year-old females with center-facial melasma (42) | Topical formulation containing the olive extract and oral placebo or Topical vehicle formulation and oral capsule containing the olive extract | Placebo | 1. Modified Melasma Area and Severity Index (mMASI): no significant difference ($p > 0.05$) 2. Melanin index: no significant difference ($p > 0.05$) | 1. Modified Melasma Area and Severity Index (mMASI) score (20) evaluated based on high resolution images and luminosity using VisioFace 1000D equipment 2. Melanin index evaluated using a spectrophotometer Mexameter | 12 weeks | <i>Olea europaea</i> | Fruit | Topical: - Oral: capsule |
| Antihirsutism | | | | | | | | | | |
| Javidnia K et al., 2003 | Iran | 16–53-year-old females with mild-to-moderate forms of idiopathic hirsutism localized to the face (45) | Creams containing 1% or 2% of Fennel extract applied twice daily | Placebo | Hair diameter from the facial area: significantly reduced using fennel extract ($p < 0.05$) | Hair diameter measurement from the facial area | 12 weeks | <i>Foeniculum vulgare</i> | Seeds | Cream |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------------------------|----------|---|---|---------|--|--|----------|------------------------------------|----------|--------|
| Vicente RA et al., 2009 | Brazil | >18-year-old females with excess terminal hair (54) | A cream containing 6.0% of <i>Stryphnodendron adstringens</i> extract | Placebo | Significant improvement (p<0.05) | Clinical examination | 26 weeks | <i>Stryphnodendron adstringens</i> | Bark | Cream |
| Sargazi A et al. 2016 | Iran | 18–24-year-old females (60) | Eucerin as a basal cream mixed with 1%, 2%, and 5% of alfalfa extract applied twice daily | Placebo | Hair growth length and hair diameters; significantly reduced (p<0.05) | Hair growth length and hair diameters measured using a caliper with 0.02-micrometer sensitivity | 12 weeks | <i>Medicago sativa</i> L. | Leaves | Cream |
| Srivilai J et al., 2016 | Thailand | 18–23-year-old females (60) | A lotion containing 1 or 5% w/w essential oil of <i>C. aeruginosa</i> | Placebo | 1. Safety pretesting (hydration, irritation, etc.): There was very little erythema and no edema 2. Hair growth: significantly diminished (p<0.05) 3. Hair density: insignificant effect (P>0.05) 4. Skin brightening: insignificant effect (p>0.05) 5. Participant questionnaire: generally positive | 1. Transepidermal water loss (TEWL) assessment using a Tewameter@TM300 2. Skin hydration assessment using a Corneometer@CM825 3. Hair growth and hair density: images recorded by a video imager, hair lengths, and numbers were measured using a computer software 4. Melanin measurement using a Mexameter@MX18 5. Skin irritation and skin flaking, or scaling assessed by a practicing | 12 weeks | <i>Curcuma aeruginosa</i> | Rhizomes | Lotion |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------------------|----------|---|--|----------------------------------|---|---|--------------------------------------|---------------------------------|------------|-------|
| | | | | | | dermatologist 6. Participant questionnaire | | | | |
| Srivilai J et al., 2018 | Thailand | 20–52-year-old females (30) | A lotion containing 5% sesquiterpene -Enriched Extract of <i>Curcuma aeruginosa</i> applied twice daily | Placebo | 1. Hair growth: delayed response, retarded hair growth was observed after week 7 2. 2. Participant questionnaire: overall satisfaction (p<0.05) | 1. Hair growth and length: images recorded by a video imager, hair lengths, and numbers were measured using a computer software 2. Participant questionnaire | 13 weeks | <i>Curcuma aeruginosa</i> | Rhizomes | - |
| Moisturizer | | | | | | | | | | |
| Filipović M et al., 2016 | Serbia | Healthy females (76) 1. Phase I: average age = 21.15 ± 2.05 (52) 2. Phase II: on sodium lauryl sulfate- (SLS-) irritated skin, average age = 29.9± 8.9 (24) | Alpine Rose stem cells (ARSC), olive oil squalene, and a natural alkyl polyglucoside cream: Formula 1: 0.4% of ARSC Formula 2: 1% of squalene Formula 3: Commercially available with 0.4% of ARSC Formula 4: | Untreated control on the forearm | Phase I: 1. Electrical capacitance (EC): significant change with formula 2 and 3 (p<0.05) 2. Transepidermal water loss (TEWL): significantly decreased with formula 2 (p<0.05) Phase II: 1. Electrical capacitance (EC): significantly increased with formula 1, 2, and 5 (p<0.05) 2. Transepidermal water loss (TEWL): significantly decreased with all tested creams (p<0.05) 3. Erythema index (EI): significantly increased with formula 1, 4, and 5 (p<0.05) | 1. Electrical capacitance (EC) using Corneometer® CM825 2. Transepidermal water loss (TEWL) using Tewameter® TM210 3. Erythema index (EI) using Mexameter® MX18 4. Skin elasticity using Cutometer® MPA580 | Phase I: 21 days Phase II: 6 days | <i>Rhododendron ferrugineum</i> | Stem cells | Cream |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------------------------|----------|--|---|-------------------------------------|--|---|------------|-----------------------------|----------|---------|
| | | | 1% of squalene + 0.4% of ARSC Formula 5: 6% of squalene + 0.4% of ARSC Formula 6: Placebo | | | | | | | |
| Milani M et al., 2017 | Italy | Healthy females with an average age of 40 years (20) | A fluid containing <i>C. asiatica</i> meristem cell culture | Untreated control | 1. Skin hydration: significantly increased (p<0.05) 2. Transepidermal water loss assessed (TEWL): significantly decreased (p<0.05) | 1. Skin hydration evaluated using a Corneometer 2. Transepidermal water loss (TEWL) evaluated using a Vapometer device | 1 day | <i>Centella asiatica</i> | Leaves | Fluid |
| Kanlayavatnanakul M et al., 2017 | Thailand | 23–39-year-old healthy males and females (24) | A gel containing 0.5% Malva nut polysaccharide (0.5%) or a formulation containing 0.2% polysaccharides, tamarind, and algae | Placebo | 1. Safety assessment: no irritation observed 2. Skin hydration: Malva nut gel was shown to hydrate the skin more effectively than tamarind and base gels (p<0.05) | 1. Safety assessment by a single application closed patch test 2. Skin hydration monitored by using Corneometer@CM 825 | 75-180 min | <i>Scaphium scaphigerum</i> | Seeds | Gel |
| Asada K et al., 2019 | Japan | 21–54-year-old males and females (47) | A hot water extract of <i>Curcuma longa</i> taken | Placebo tablets contained safflower | 1. Water content of the skin surface: significantly increased (p>0.05) 2. Transepidermal water loss | 1. Water content of the skin surface measured with a Skicon-200EX | 8-weeks | <i>Curcuma longa</i> | Rhizomes | Tablets |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------------------|----------|---|--|--|--|---|---------|----------------------------|---------|-------|
| | | | daily or a hot water extract + curcumin | color and kaoliang color to match the color of the other tablets | (TEWL): no significant difference (p>0.05) 3. Minimal erythema dose (MED): no significant difference (p>0.05) | 2. Transepidermal water loss (TEWL) measured using a Vapo Scan ASVT100RS 3. Minimal erythema dose (MED) performed using a solar simulator 601-300 2.5 UV Multiport | | | | |
| Anti-inflammatory | | | | | | | | | | |
| Zhang YQ et al, 2014 | China | 18–65-year-old males and females (40) | A cream containing 3% cherry blossom extract applied twice daily to forearm with induced irritation using occlusive application of 3% sodium lauryl sulfate (SLS) for 24 hours | Placebo | 1. Visual erythema scores: significantly decreased from the third day (p<0.05) 2. Erythema value: significantly decreased from the fifth day (p<0.05) | 1. Visual erythema scores were evaluated by dermatologist 2. Erythema value measurement using Mexameter MX18 | 9 days | <i>Prunus yedoensis</i> | Flowers | Cream |
| Boonchai W et al., 2017 | Thailand | 15–72-year-old males and females with mild-to-moderate facial dermatitis (80) | A cream containing 4-t-butylcyclohexanol and licochalcone | 0.02% triamcinolone | 1. Physician's assessment: significantly improved (p<0.05) 2. Skin hydration: significantly increased (p<0.05) | 1. Physician's assessment and redness score using a Eucerin redness rating card 2. Skin hydration and | 4 weeks | <i>Glycyrrhiza inflata</i> | - | Cream |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------------------------|-------------|--|---|---------------------------|--|---|----------|--|--|-------|
| | | | applied twice daily | | 3. Patients evaluation of sensory symptoms: significantly decreased (p<0.05) | TEWL measured using a Corneometer CM825 and a Tewameter TM300 3. Patients evaluation of sensory symptoms for itching, pain, burning sensation, tingling, and redness using 10 cm visual analog scale | | | | |
| Seiwerth J et al., 2019 | Germany | Healthy males and females (42) | Cream with gentian, liquorice, and willow extract | 1% hydrocortisone acetate | Ultraviolet (UV)-erythema test: significantly reduced compared with vehicle only (P<0.05) | Ultraviolet (UV)-erythema test using a Mexameter | 48 hours | Gentian: <i>Gentiana lutea</i> liquorice: <i>Glycyrrhiza glabra</i> Willow: <i>Salix daphnoides</i> | <i>Gentiana lutea</i> : root <i>Glycyrrhiza glabra</i> : root <i>Salix daphnoides</i> : bark | Cream |
| Acne treatment | | | | | | | | | | |
| Lee HE et al., 2011 | South Korea | 15–41-year-old males and females with mild-to-moderate acne (97) | APDDR-0901 (0.03% retinol, 0.7% rose extract, and 0.05% hexamidine diisethionate), daily in the evening | 0.1% adapalene gel | 1. Median percent change in lesion count: significantly improved from baseline (p<0.05) 2. Acne grade: significantly improved from baseline (p<0.05) 3. Physician-assessed global improvement: 84% achieved a significant response 4. Patient self-assessment: 77% reported improvement -Adverse effects including | 1. Median percent change in lesion count 2. Acne grade 3. Physician-assessed global improvement 4. Patient self-assessment | 12 weeks | - | - | - |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------------------|---------|--|---|---|---|---|---------|---|---|---|
| | | | | | pricking were reported | | | | | |
| Weber N et al., 2018 | Germany | 21–49-year-old males and females with oily skin (21) | A cleanser containing coco-Glucoside, <i>Simmondsia chinensis</i> oil, <i>Gentiana lutea</i> extract, <i>Mentha arvensis</i> oil, <i>Humulus lupulus</i> extract, <i>Leptospermum scoparium</i> oil, <i>Salix daphnoides</i> extract, <i>Helianthus annuus</i> oil, Pectin, Xanthan gum | Face cleanser with sodium laureth sulfate | 1. Skin sebum: significantly reduced only on day 17 after the application 2. Good skin tolerability 3. Self-assessment: participants reported pleasant skin sensation | 1. Skin sebum measurement using Sebumeter 2. Skin erythema measurement using a Mexameter 3. Self-assessment | 8 weeks | - | <i>Simmondsia chinensis</i> : seed <i>Gentiana lutea</i> : roots <i>Mentha arvensis</i> <i>Humulus lupulus</i> <i>Leptospermum scoparium</i> <i>Salix daphnoides</i> <i>Helianthus annuus</i> | <i>Simmondsia chinensis</i> : seed <i>Gentiana lutea</i> : roots <i>Leptospermum scoparium</i> : branch/leaf <i>Salix daphnoides</i> : bark <i>Helianthus annuus</i> : seed |
| Foot care | | | | | | | | | | |
| Mandawgade SD et al., 2008 | India | Healthy males and females suffering from different foot ailments (6) | A cream containing mango butter and olein fraction, fortified with vitamin E acetate (1% w/w) | Untreated Control | 1. Assessment of functional attributes: complete repair of cracked skin in all the volunteers. Antiseptic, healing, soothing, and cooling actions were predominant in most of the clinical subjects 2. Assessment of aesthetic attributes: Excellent emolliency, rebuilt protective skin barrier and replenished moisture, and improve | 1. Assessment of functional attributes: reduction in amplitude of cracked heels, pain, and bleeding through the cracks, degree of healing, skin reconstruction, soothing, skin rehydration, and antiseptic against the growth of resident | 8 weeks | - | Fruit kernels | Cream |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|---------------------------------|-------------|--|--|----------------------------------|--|---|-------------------|----------------------------|--------|----------|
| | | | | | smoothness. Had good appearance, spreadability, skin feel, smoothness, and absorption (p<0.05) | microorganisms 2. Assessment of aesthetic attributes: appearance, spreadability, skin feel, smoothness, and absorption | | | | |
| Akhtar N et al., 2016 | Pakistan | 25–35-year-old healthy males (13) | An emulsion containing 4 % <i>Ziziphus mauritiana</i> extract | Placebo | Erythema: significantly decreased in both groups (p<0.05) Melanin content: significantly decreased (p<0.05) Skin moisture: significantly increased (p>0.05) Skin elasticity: significantly increased (p<0.05) Sebum content: significantly increased (p<0.05) | Melanin content, skin erythema, skin elasticity, sebum content, and skin moisture were evaluated using Mexameter, Corneometer, Visioscan, and Sebumeter MPA 5 | 8 weeks | <i>Ziziphus mauritiana</i> | Leaves | Emulsion |
| Rosacea | | | | | | | | | | |
| Braithwaite I et al., 2015 | New Zealand | Males and females aged 16 or over with a doctor's diagnosis of rosacea on the face (138) | Cream containing medical-grade Kanuka honey with 10% glycerine applied twice daily | Cetomacrogol cream | 1. Baseline assessments (the IGA-RSS): significantly improved (p<0.05) 2. Participant-rated rosacea severity visual analog score (VAS-S) on a 100 mm scale: significantly improved (p<0.001) 3. Participant-rated dermatology quality of life index (DLQI): no significant difference (p>0.05) | 1. Baseline assessments (the IGA-RSS) 2. Participant-rated rosacea severity visual analog score (VAS-S) on a 100 mm scale 3. Participant-rated dermatology quality of life index (DLQI) | 8 weeks | - | - | Cream |
| Stretch marks prevention | | | | | | | | | | |
| Soltanipour F, 2014 | Iran | 20–30-year-old nulliparous females with | 1 cm ³ of olive oil applied twice daily | Saj cream (a commercial product) | Striae severity: no significant effects on development and severity of striae gravidarum | Striae severity assessed using the Davey method | The subjects were | <i>Olea europaea</i> | Fruit | Oil |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------------------------|--------|--|--|--|---|---|--|--------------------|---|-----|
| | | gestational age of 18–20 weeks (150) | on the skin of abdomen gently without massage | containing lanolin, stearin, triethanolamine, almond oil, and bizovax glycerin amidine) Control (no intervention) | (p= 0.43) | | followed until gestational week of 38-40 | | | |
| Scars reduction | | | | | | | | | | |
| Hosnuter M et al., 2007 | Turkey | Males and females with hypertrophic and keloid scars and an average age of 40.3 ± 9.6 (72) | Group 1: topical onion extract only Group 2: silicone gel sheet only Group 3 (n=20): combined onion extract and silicone gel sheet | Groups compared with each other | 1. Clinical evaluation: A) A significant difference in the color parameter between groups 1 and 2 and in the height parameter between the groups 1 and 3 (p<0.01 and p<0.05 respectively) B) A significant reduction in scar erythema in group 1 compared with group 2 (p<0.05) C) TA significant reduction in scar height in group 3 compared with group 1 (p<0.05) 2. Patient assessment: A) No significant difference in hardness, itching, and pain between all groups (p>0.05) B) A significant improvement in scar color, hardness, and pain in group 1, and a significant improvement scar color, hardness, height, and | 1. Clinical evaluation by one plastic surgeon 2. Patients' assessment of scar color, scar height, scar hardness, itching, and pain 3. A global assessment of the clinical course of scar development evaluated using a therapeutic index (TI) | 25 weeks | <i>Allium cepa</i> | - | Gel |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------------------|----------|---|--|---------|--|--|----------|--------------------------|---------|----------|
| | | | | | itching groups 2 and 3 3. Evaluation of the therapeutic index (TI): The total TI of group 3 was better than the others | | | | | |
| Multiple effects | | | | | | | | | | |
| Muhammad KW et al., 2015 | Pakistan | 25–35-year-old males (11) | W/O emulsion containing 4% w/w tamarind extract applied twice daily | Placebo | 1. Skin sebum contents: significantly decreased with respect to time ($p \leq 0.05$) 2. Skin melanin contents: significant regular decline in skin melanin values with respect to time ($p \leq 0.05$) | 1. Skin sebum contents using a Sebumeter MPA5 2. Skin melanin contents using a Mexameter MPA5 | 12 weeks | <i>Tamarindus indica</i> | Seeds | Emulsion |
| Matsuyama A et al., 2018 | Japan | 35–59-year-old females with mild skin problems (20) | A capsule containing 150 mg Sakura Extract-P (cherry blossom) taken once daily | Placebo | 1. Advanced glycation end products (AGEs) and skin parameters: significantly decreased 2. Skin moisture: significantly decreased in both groups ($p < 0.01$) 3. Transepidermal water loss (TEWL): significantly increased 4. VISIA and skin replica parameters: the number of facial spots and reddish areas decreased significantly. Skin texture and the number of pores did not change significantly. UV-reactive spots increased significantly. The other parameters showed no changes. 5. Questionnaire results: no significant differences | 1. Advanced glycation end products (AGEs) measured using an AGE reader 2. Skin moisture measured using a Corneometer 3. Transepidermal water loss (TEWL) measured using a Tewameter 4. Skin elasticity measured using a Cutometer 5. Skin replica analyzed using a reflective 3-dimensional replica analysis system 6. Facial condition assessed by a face image analyzer (VISIA Evolution) | 8 weeks | <i>Prunus serrulata</i> | Flowers | Capsule |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------------|----------|--------------------|--|---------|---|---|----------|-----------------------------|---------|----------|
| | | | | | | 7. Evaluation of spots, wrinkles, texture, pores, ultraviolet (UV) reactive spots, brown spots, reddish areas, and porphyrin using an image captured with a VISIA Evolution 8. Questionnaires regarding skin condition | | | | |
| Ahmad HI et al. 2020 | Pakistan | Healthy males (13) | An emulsion containing <i>S. indicus</i> extract applied twice daily | Placebo | 1. Assessment of skin erythema and melanin level: significant decrease in erythema index and melanin level ($p \leq 0.05$) 2. Assessment of skin hydration level: significantly increased ($p \leq 0.05$) 3. Assessment of skin elasticity: significantly increased ($p \leq 0.05$) 4. Assessment of skin sebum level: significantly decreased ($p \leq 0.05$) 5. Surface evaluation of living skin: significant decrease of both large and small pores ($p \leq 0.05$) | 1. Assessment of skin erythema and melanin level measured using Mexameter® 2. Assessment of skin hydration level using Corneometer® 3. Assessment of skin elasticity using Elastometer® 4. Assessment of skin sebum level using Sebumeter® 5. Surface evaluation of living skin assessed using VisioFace® and investigation of the number of large and small pores, area of skin spots, and wrinkles using images | 12 weeks | <i>Sphaeranthus indicus</i> | Flowers | Emulsion |